| **Student Name:** Ethan |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers a benevolent dictatorship compared to an unstable democracy. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher comments: P1  We want a government that cares. How do you ensure that? The hook is not giving a direction to the debate.  Characterization:  – Benefit of the citizens, and care for the “entire” population. Why is this likely a true interpretation?  – Unstable democracy means we are constantly switching; so there will be harm to business. Again, you are assuming this to be the case. Why is it true?  – Bulgaria has five elections in two years; ok, but is that the only possible interpretation of the motion?  – They cannot ensure the four principles. Participation is less for voter fatigue. Assuming this is true, why does it matter e.g., why is voting important? Transparency, I am unclear why people are likely to care about it.  – You can try to explain why a benevolent government is likely to stay uncorrupted; you could say that this is because there is an incentive to maintain financial stability - because without that, your government has no legitimacy! You could also point out that financial theft and corruption might really help the legitimacy of the government and possibly spark a revolution!  Argument 1: more people benefitted  – I am unclear why they will ensure no one is excluded.  – – Oftentimes a benevolent dictator would “probably not want what is worse for their country” is not the strongest analysis. What if they are actually bad, or have bad intent?  – Proposition fiat? How does fiat ensure they will “always” be benevolent? – Even if all of the good things are true, why will there be a continuation of it? Is it because of a system that's established? Is it because of the mentorship of the last ruler? Is it because of the trend they have likely observed? Is it because in case of a handover, likely a respected or nationally accepted person is given the throne? There can be a plethora of reasons here, but you need to structurally explain parts of it.  Style: Tone variation needs to increase, more eye-contact would help too!  Speech time: 5:01; no POI taken. Please make sure to take POIs. |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Cyrus |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers a benevolent dictatorship compared to an unstable democracy. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher comments: O1  Hook where? Please give a direction to your speech.  Setup  – Human beings are inherently selfish. Why? How much is it applicable here?  – Even if they are not selfish, they do not care all the time. Impact this! Do not leave it there.  – Dictators can never know what people actually know, or how.  – Benevolent dictators are dictators too. One person cannot represent an entire society – how is that real?  – They do not know what the people wants. Why is this true? And how is this comparative? Please do not leave the assertion to itself!  Rebuttal  – In an unstable democracy, you say switching of parties will increase checks and balances. And then, you are being a bit assertive as to why the checks and balances in a democracy are likely to work; but, you also want to make sure to explain why these checks, if they work, are going to work in a way that is good. Structural analysis is key!  Argument 1  – I am unclear on the potential for conflict  – Why are both arguments details left for the next speaker  Argument 2  – Why does freedom of speech matter? Please give more analysis. Is it because it's a fundamental right that ensures your rights are protected? Is it because it helps you hold your government accountable? Try to make sure that you tie your characterisation into a larger picture; so, when you tell us about the principles of democracy etc, what do these principles matter and why do we need to have these principles?  – Why does representation matter? Why should it matter even if it's in an unstable country? Is it because otherwise they are at an increased risk? To what extent is the risk a concern? Why do they matter? Is it because there is a unique responsibility to protect the vulnerable that is exclusively high in a democratic system?  Style: Tone variation needs to increase, hand gesture needs to adjust more!  Speech time: 5:04 |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Theo |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers a benevolent dictatorship compared to an unstable democracy. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher comments: P2  Hook – please indicate what your argument direction is, just repeating stance is not the most useful.  Setup  – I am unclear why this benevolent person will have continuation. – Even if all of the good things are true, why will there be a continuation of it? Is it because of a system that's established? Is it because of the mentorship of the last ruler? Is it because of the trend they have likely observed? Is it because in case of a handover, likely a respected or nationally accepted person is given the throne? There can be a plethora of reasons here, but you need to structurally explain parts of it.  Argument 1  – On view that impacts society, I am unclear why dictators would have this specific opinion/ view that is all encompassing.  – – Moreover, I think that when you are trying to explain what a democracy looks like (e.g., people want to select the bad option in a democratic sense) you need to explain to me why this happens. Because it seems slightly counterintuitive to the average judge! Is it because people are short-sighted? Is it because social media/ fluid media’s influence affects leadership negatively?  Argument 2  – Why is it true that benevolent dictatorships are “as heavily” efficient as you claim it to be? Is it because you are presuming there is only one decision maker and so decisions are quicker? But would not that also mean less human capital to draft policies and so on in the first place? More importantly, where is the balance between efficiency and quality here? Without check-in-balance mechanisms of independent bodies, policies are less likely to be well-crafted, no?  Style: Please speak more confidently, and take limited breaks.  Speech time: 5:07 |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Tongtong |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers a benevolent dictatorship compared to an unstable democracy. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher comments: O2  Hook – please give a direction to what the speech is going to prioritize. Please do not just repeat the stance.  Argument 1  – I am unclear why you have representation that is “better” or is debate winning]  – Why does representation matter? Why should it matter even if it's in an unstable country? Is it because otherwise they are at an increased risk? To what extent is the risk a concern? Why do they matter? Is it because there is a unique responsibility to protect the vulnerable that is exclusively high in a democratic system?  – POI: the question asked the same; e.g., if representation helps; the answer just says dictators may be more hungry for power.  – On freedom of speech, – why does freedom of speech matter? Please give more analysis. Is it because it's a fundamental right that ensures your rights are protected? Is it because it helps you hold your government accountable? Try to make sure that you tie your characterisation into a larger picture; so, when you tell us about the principles of democracy etc, what do these principles matter and why do we need to have these principles?  Argument 2  – Abuse of power, “they can use power” is not enough analysis. Why will they do it? Whats the likelihood?  – Why does accountability matter? Element of accountability does not guarantee good outcomes; especially when the accountability system is compromised. For example, in the US, Trump had appointed supreme court judges that he had control over, which limited accountability.  – You are being a bit assertive as to why the checks and balances in a democracy are likely to work; but, you also want to make sure to explain why these checks, if they work, are going to work in a way that is good. Structural analysis is key!  Style: Please increase eye-contact, and please focus on increasing clarity of speech; tonal variation needs to increase.  Speech time: 5:07 |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Emillia |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers a benevolent dictatorship compared to an unstable democracy. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher comments: P3  Hook should not be just restating your side of the debate, but it should be real life analysis of what that looks like, and why.  Compartment 1  – Why is it true that they care for most people, as dictators?  – There are several incentives that you could bring up for a dictator; it's not just that people will choose them, but rather, dictatorships have an incentive to be good to avoid being thrown out of power, etc. It is not ideal even for a dictator to have constant protests against them, for instance. Especially because any of these movements can easily extend to be violent, or to even throw them out.  – When you suggested that the principles of democracy may not be the best; why so? I think you first need to make sure that you are actively telling me what these principles look like AND what the value of these principles are.  – Moreover, I think that when you are trying to explain what a democracy looks like (e.g., people want to select the bad option in a democratic sense) you need to explain to me why this happens. Because it seems slightly counterintuitive to the average judge! Is it because people are short-sighted? Is it because social media/ fluid media’s influence affects leadership negatively?  Compartment 2  – “We have a way to create a just environment” - but how exactly? This claim needs structural mechanisation to explain why that is likely.  – You can try to explain why a benevolent government is likely to stay uncorrupted; you could say that this is because there is an incentive to maintain financial stability - because without that, your government has no legitimacy! You could also point out that financial theft and corruption might really help the legitimacy of the government and possibly spark a revolution!  – People don’t want racist takes/ people have their preferences. I get that. I am unclear how you are preventing conflicts on these basis? You need to give more analysis on these factors.  Style: Clarity is good, but please work on eye-contact and confidence!  Speech time: 5:15 |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Ellie |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers a benevolent dictatorship compared to an unstable democracy. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher comments: O3  Hook should not be just restating your side of the debate, but it should be real life analysis of what that looks like, and why.  Compartment 1  – I am unclear why dictators are always selfish. I am also unclear what they are selfish about. I do not know why a democratic leader is better. Where is the comparative?  – POI ANS: continuation of benevolence is unlikely because they can become greedy. Again, what's the structural analysis here? Why is this likely true?  – On accountability, why does accountability matter? Element of accountability does not guarantee good outcomes; especially when the accountability system is compromised. For example, in the US, Trump had appointed supreme court judges that he had control over, which limited accountability.  Compartment 2  – Why does representation matter? Why should it matter even if it's in an unstable country? Is it because otherwise they are at an increased risk? To what extent is the risk a concern? Why do they matter? Is it because there is a unique responsibility to protect the vulnerable that is exclusively high in a democratic system?  – Why does participation matter? Is it because this requires everyone to have a responsibility? Is it because it ensures space of opinion for everyone? Such as in voting polls, that everyone matters, as any swing voting block can bring massive changes?  – Why does freedom of speech matter? Please give more analysis. Is it because it's a fundamental right that ensures your rights are protected? Is it because it helps you hold your government accountable? Try to make sure that you tie your characterisation into a larger picture; so, when you tell us about the principles of democracy etc, what do these principles matter and why do we need to have these principles?  Style: Please do not get lost laughing while responding.  Speech: 5:17 |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Josephine |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers a benevolent dictatorship compared to an unstable democracy. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| Teacher comments: OR  Hook – please indicate what your speech direction is going to be/ prioritize your teamcase.  Style: Please limit the number of pauses, and please try to increase eye-contact.  Compartment 1  – You stated representation and accountability often. I am unclear why these principles matter. I am also unclear how they manifest in an unstable democracy. I do not see the comparative here because you are not telling me why your side is better.  – Why does representation matter? Why should it matter even if it's in an unstable country? Is it because otherwise they are at an increased risk? To what extent is the risk a concern? Why do they matter? Is it because there is a unique responsibility to protect the vulnerable that is exclusively high in a democratic system?  – All parties will be represented in democracy. Is this true? Are they equally, or equitably, or sufficiently represented?  – Why does participation matter? Is it because this requires everyone to have a responsibility? Is it because it ensures space of opinion for everyone? Such as in voting polls, that everyone matters, as any swing voting block can bring massive changes?  Compartment 2  – I am unclear why you have citizens support more. Why will they support it even if it's unstable?  – You state freedom matters the most.  – Why does freedom of speech matter? Please give more analysis. Is it because it's a fundamental right that ensures your rights are protected? Is it because it helps you hold your government accountable? Try to make sure that you tie your characterisation into a larger picture; so, when you tell us about the principles of democracy etc, what do these principles matter and why do we need to have these principles?  Speech time: 5:00 – thank you for sticking to your efforts! |
| --- |